arXiv:1604.04750v1 [math-ph] 16 Apr 2016

An algebraic condition for the Bisognano-Wichmann Property

Vincenzo Morinelli*
Dipartimento di Matematica, Università di Roma Tor Vergata,
Via della Ricerca Scientifica, 1, I-00133 Roma, Italy
E-mail: morinell@mat.uniroma2.it

Abstract

The Bisognano-Wichmann property for local, Poincaré covariant nets of standard subspaces is discussed. We present a sufficient algebraic condition on the covariant representation ensuring Bisognano-Wichmann and Duality properties without further assumptions on the net. Our *"modularity"* condition holds for direct integrals of scalar massive and masselss representations. We conclude that in these cases the Bisognano-Wichmann property is much weaker than the Split property. Furthermore, we present a class of massive modular covariant nets not satisfying the Bisognano-Wichmann property.

1 Introduction

The Tomita-Takesaki theory for von Neumann algebras has a crucial role in the study of geometric properties of Quantum Field Theories. Bisognano and Wichmann showed that, in Wightman theories, modular groups associated to wedge regions have a geometrical interpretation: they implement pure Lorentz transformations [1, 2].

Let $\mathbb{R}^{1+3} \supset \mathcal{O} \mapsto \mathcal{A}(\mathcal{O}) \subset \mathcal{B}(\mathcal{H})$ be a local Poincaré covariant net of von Neumann algebras on a fixed Hilbert space $\mathcal{H}$, from certain open, connected bounded regions of the Minkowski spacetime $\mathbb{R}^{1+3}$. Let U be a positive energy Poincaré representation acting covariantly on $\mathcal{A}$ and let Ω be the unique (up to a phase) normalized U-invariant vector, namely the vacuum vector. Ω is supposed to be cyclic for all the local algebras. The **Bisognano-Wichmann** property (B-W) is stated as follows:

$$U(\Lambda_W(2\pi t)) = \Delta^{-it}_{\mathcal{A}(W),\Omega}, \tag{1}$$

for any wedge shaped region W, where $t \mapsto \Lambda_W(t)$ is the one parameter group of boosts associated to the wedge W and $\Delta^{it}_{\mathcal{A}(W),\Omega}$ is the modular group associated to $\mathcal{A}(W) = (\cup_{\mathcal{O}\subset W}\mathcal{A}(\mathcal{O}))''$ w.r.t. Ω. The Bisognano-Wichmann property strictly links the covariant representation of the Poincaré group to the net: in a precise sense it is enclosed in the net once we choose the vacuum state and the algebra of the observables.

*partially supported by ERC and GNAMPA-INdAM

It is a basic fact in many aspects of QFT: it holds in massive theories [14], it implies the Spin-Statistics canonical relations [9] and the essential Duality property. References on Duality and Bisognano-Wichmann properties can be found in Refs. [4, 5, 15, 7, 14, 6]. In general, counter-examples have a pathological nature. For instance, theories having an infinite number of particles in the same mass multiplet do not need to satisfy the B-W property (cf. Sect. 5).

The Bisognano-Wichmann property cares only about the modular structure of the algebraic model which is contained in the standard subspace structure of the net. Standard subspace techniques give a fruitful approach to QFT. For instance, they are useful to model first quantization nets, giving a canonical structure to free fields (cf. Brunetti-Guido-Longo construction in Ref. [3]), and they have a keyrole in finding localization properties of Infinite Spin particles, cf. Ref. [12].

One should expect an algebraic description of the B-W property. We ask when a (unitary, postive energy) Poincaré representation U is *modular*, i.e. any net of standard subspaces it acts covariantly on satisfies the B-W property, in particular U is implemented by modular operators. This is expected, at least, for irreducible Poincaré, positive energy representations. We present an *algebraic condition* ensuring the modularity of a representation. It holds at least for scalar Poincaré representations in any spacetime $\mathbb{R}^{1+s}$, with $s \geq 3$.

This analysis is useful to compute counterexamples. We describe a massive, modular covariant net, not respecting the B-W property. The massless case is contained in Ref. [12]. Furthermore, an outlook on the relation between modular covariance and Split property on generalized free fields is given. Details about this analysis can be found in Ref. [13].

2 One particle net

A linear, real, closed subspace H of a complex Hilbert space $\mathcal{H}$ is called *cyclic* if $H + iH$ is dense in $\mathcal{H}$, *separating* if $H \cap iH = \{0\}$ and *standard* if it is cyclic and separating. Let H be a standard subspace, the Tomita operator S_H is the closure, of the densely defined anti-linear involution

$$H + iH \ni \xi + i\eta \mapsto \xi - i\eta \in H + iH, \qquad \xi, \eta \in H.$$

Its polar decomposition $S_H = J_H \Delta_H^{1/2}$ defines the positive selfadjoint *modular operator* Δ_H and the anti-unitary *modular conjugation* J_H. Δ_H is invertible and

$$J_H \Delta_H J_H = \Delta_H^{-1}. \tag{2}$$

Standard subspaces are in 1-1 correspondence with densely defined antilinear involutions which are in 1-1 correspondence with pairs of an antiunitary, involutions and selfadjoint operators satisfying (2). Here is a basic Lemma on standard subspaces.

Lemma 2.1. [10, 11] *Let $H, K \subset \mathcal{H}$ be standard subspaces and $U \in \mathcal{U}(\mathcal{H})$ be a unitary operator on $\mathcal{H}$ s.t. $UH = K$. Then $U\Delta_H U^* = \Delta_K$ and $UJ_H U^* = J_K$.*

Consider the (proper, orthocronous) Poincaré group $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ of the 3+1 dimensional Minkowski spacetime $\mathbb{R}^{3+1}$. $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ is the semidirect product of 4-translations and the connected component of the identity of the Lorentz group denoted by $\mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow$. A wedge shaped region W in $\mathbb{R}^{3+1}$ is an open region of the form gW_1 where $g \in \mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ and $W_1 = \{p \in \mathbb{R}^{3+1} : |p_0| < p_1\}$. W'

denotes the causal complement of W w.r.t. the causal structure of $\mathbb{R}^{3+1}$. The set of wedges is denoted by $\mathcal{W}$. $\mathcal{W}_0$ denotes the subset of wedges of the form gW_1 where $g \in \mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow$. For every wedge $W \in \mathcal{W}$ there exists a unique 1-parameter group of Poincaré boosts $t \mapsto \Lambda_W$ preserving W, i.e. $\Lambda_W(t)W = W$ for every $t \in \mathbb{R}$.

Let U be a unitary, positive energy representation (p.e.r.) of the Poincaré group $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ on an Hilbert space $\mathcal{H}$. We shall call a U-covariant net of standard subspaces on wedges a map

$$H : \mathcal{W} \ni W \longmapsto H(W) \subset \mathcal{H},$$

associating to every wedge in $\mathbb{R}^{1+3}$ a closed real linear subspace of $\mathcal{H}$, s.t.:

1. **Isotony:** if $W_1, W_2 \in \mathcal{W}$, $W_1 \subset W_2$ then $H(W_1) \subset H(W_2)$
2. **Poincaré Covariance:** $\forall W \in \mathcal{W}$, $g \in \mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$: $U(g)H(W) = H(gW)$.
3. **Reeh-Schlieder Property:** $\forall W \in \mathcal{W}$, $H(W)$ is a cyclic subspace of $\mathcal{H}$.
4. **Locality:** $\forall W_1, W_2 \in \mathcal{W}$ s.t. $W_1 \subset W_2'$: $H(W_1) \subset H(W_2)'$.

We shall indicate with (U, H) a Poincaré covariant net of standard subspaces satisfying 1-4[1]. The **Bisognano-Wichmann Property** in this setting is stated as follows:

$$U(\Lambda_W(2\pi t)) = \Delta_{H(W)}^{-it}, \qquad \forall t \in \mathbb{R}.$$

Duality property states that $H(W) = H(W')'$.

The proper Poincaré group $\mathcal{P}_+$ is generated by $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ and the space and time reflection Θ. An irreducible unitary representation of the Poincaré group always extends to an (anti-)unitary representation of $\mathcal{P}_+$ (i.e. unitary on $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$, anti-unitary on $\theta\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$) except for finite helicity representations which have to be coupled. The following theorem is a consequence of the Brunetti-Guido-Longo construction.

Theorem 2.2. *[3] There is a 1-1 correspondence between:*

a. (Anti-)unitary positive energy representation of $\mathcal{P}_+$.

b. Local nets of standard subspaces satisfying 1-4 and B-W Property.

In view of Theorem 2.2, our question becomes: which families of representations preserve the 1-1 correspondence when the B-W property is not assumed?

3 A modularity condition for the Bisognano-Wichmann Property

For every $W \in \mathcal{W}_0$, we shall call G_W^0 the set $\{g \in \mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow : gW = W\}$. G_W denotes the Poincaré subgroup generated by the translation group and G_W^0. By transitivity of $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ on wedges, G_W^0 and G_W can be defined for any $W \in \mathcal{W}$. The strongly continuous map

$$Z_{H(W)} : \mathbb{R} \ni t \mapsto \Delta_{H(W)}^{it} U(\Lambda_W(2\pi t)) \in \mathcal{U}(\mathcal{H})$$

[1]It is possible to generalize the assumptions to fermionic representations assuming twisted-locality on H [12]. The forthcoming analysis continues to hold.

is the proper quotient between the modular group of a wedge subspace and the unitary implementation of the one parameter boost transformations associated to W. Indeed, it has to be identity map if the B-W property holds.

The following proposition is a consequence of $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$-covariance and Lemma 2.1.

Proposition 3.1. *Let (U, H) be a Poincaré covariant net of standard subspaces. Then, for every $W \in \mathcal{W}$, $t \mapsto Z_{H(W)}(t)$ defines a one-parameter group and*

$$Z_{H(W)}(t) \in U(G_W)', \qquad \forall t \in \mathbb{R}.$$

Here is stated our algebraic condition, sufficient to modularity.
Modularity condition: let $r_W \in \mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$, s.t. $r_W W = W'$, then

$$U(r_W) \in U(G_W)''. \tag{M}$$

Theorem 3.2. *Let (U, H) be a Poincaré covariant net of standard subspaces. Let $W \in \mathcal{W}$, and $r_W \in \mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$ be s.t. $r_W W = W'$. If $Z_{H(W)}$ commutes with $U(r_W)$, then the Bisognano-Wichmann and Duality properties hold.*

The proof goes as follows. By hypotheses and covariance we have $Z_{H(W)} = Z_{H(W')}$. As $Z_{H(W)}$ is a one parameter group of automorphisms of $H(W)$, by the KMS condition, Duality and B-W properties follow.

It is a corollary that representations satisfying (M) are modular.

Corollary 3.3. *With the assumptions of Theorem 3.2, if condition* (M) *holds on U, then Bisognano-Wichmann and Duality properties hold on H.*

The above property easily extends to direct integrals and multiples of representations as the following proposition shows.

Proposition 3.4. *Let U and $\{U_x\}_{x\in X}$ be p.e.r of $\widetilde{\mathcal{P}}_+^\uparrow$ satisfying (M).*

Let $\mathcal{K}$ be an Hilbert space, (M) holds for $U \otimes 1_{\mathcal{K}} \in \mathcal{B}(\mathcal{H} \otimes \mathcal{K})$.

Let (X, μ) be a standard measure space. Assume that $U_x|_{G_W}$ and $U_y|_{G_W}$ are disjoint for μ-a.e. $x \neq y$ in X. Then $U = \int_X U_x d\mu(x)$ satisfies (M).

4 The scalar case

As we have announced, the above analysis holds for scalar representations.

Proposition 4.1. *Let U be a unitary irreducible scalar representation of the Poicaré group. Then U satisfies the modularity condition* (M).

The proof relies on two facts. Translations of a scalar representation generate a maximal abelian sub-algebra (MASA) of $\mathcal{B}(\mathcal{H})$ and r_W preserves G_W^0 orbits of the m-mass hyperboloid (a.e. orbits in the massless case).

Theorem 4.2. *Let $U = \int_{[0,+\infty)} U_m d\mu(m)$ where $\{U_m\}$ are (finite or infinite) multiples of the scalar representation of mass m. Then U satisfies (M), hence Duality and Bisognano-Wichmann properties hold.*

It is a consequence of Theorem 4.1 and Proposition 3.4.

This analysis holds in any Minkowski spacetime $\mathbb{R}^{s+1}$ with $s \geq 3$.

5 Counterexamples and Outlook

Consider $U_{m,s}$ m-mass, and s-spin, unitary, irreducible representation of the Poincaré group $\mathcal{P}_+^\uparrow$. Let $W \mapsto H(W)$ be the canonical net associated to $U_{m,s}$. Let V be a unitary, non trivial, representation of $\mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow$ on an Hilbert space $\mathcal{K}$, which is real, i.e. there exists a standard subspace $K \subset \mathcal{K}$ preserved by V and s.t. $\Delta_K = 1$ and $J_K K = K$. We can define the following new net of standard subspaces (cf. Ref.[12] for standardness),

$$K \otimes H : \mathcal{W} \ni W \longmapsto K \otimes H(W) \subset \mathcal{K} \otimes \mathcal{H}.$$

Two Poincaré representations act covariantly on $K \otimes H$:

$$U_I(a,\Lambda) \equiv 1 \otimes U_{m,s}(a,\Lambda) \qquad \text{and} \qquad U_V(a,\Lambda) \equiv V(\Lambda) \otimes U_{m,s}(a,\Lambda),$$

where $\Lambda \in \mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow$, $a \in \mathbb{R}^{3+1}$. U_I is implemented by $K \otimes H$ modular operators and Bisognano-Wichmann property holds w.r.t. U_I. Note that when $s = 0$, U_I satisfies the modularity condition (M), hence the B-W property also follows by Corollary 3.3. It is obvious by construction that U_V does not satisfy B-W property on $K \otimes H$ except when V is the trivial representation. Notice that V could be chosen as a representation of $\mathrm{SL}(2,\mathbb{C})$ (i.e. the universal covering of $\mathcal{L}_+^\uparrow$) and thus a wrong Spin-Statistics relation would follow for U_V.

U_V decomposes into a direct sum of infinitely many inequivalent representations of mass m, in particular infinitely many spins have finite multiplicity [13]. It is interesting to look for natural counterexamples to modular covariance, in the class of representations excluded by this discussion, if they exist. We expect that a modularity condition could be established on a finite direct sum of factorial Poincaré representations.

We briefly give an outlook on the relation between B-W and Split property, a strong statistical independence property in QFT defined by Doplicher and Longo in Ref. [8].

An inclusion of von Neumann algebras $(N \subset M, \Omega)$ is said to be *Split* if there exists an intermediate type I factor F $(N \subset F \subset M)$. Analogously we define an inclusion of standard subspaces $K \subset H$ *Split* iff their second quantization von Neumann algebras give a Split inclusion. Our analysis suggests that the Bisognano-Wichmann property is *much weaker* than the Split property. Indeed, consider a net (U, H) be a Poincaré covariant net, assume that U is a direct integral of scalar representations. The Split property on the U-canonical net requires that U shall be purely atomic on masses, concentrated on isolated points and for each mass there can only be a finite multiple of the scalar representation[8, 13]. The disintegration satisfies the modularity condition (M) and the modularity of U follows by Corollary 3.3.

Acknowledgements

I hearthful thank Roberto Longo for suggesting me the problem and Mihály Weiner for comments on preliminary version of this paper.

References

[1] J.J. Bisognano, E.H. Wichmann, On the Duality condition for quantum fields, *J. Math. Phys.* **17** (1976), 303–321.

[2] J.J. Bisognano, E.H. Wichmann, On the Duality condition for Hermitian scalar field, *J. Math. Phys.* **16** (1975), 985–1007.

[3] R. Brunetti, D. Guido, R. Longo, Modular localization and Wigner particles, *Rev. Math. Phys.* **14**, N. 7 & 8 (2002), 759–786.

[4] H.J. Borchers, On Poincaré transformations and the modular group of the algebra associated with a wedge, *Lett. Math. Phys.* 46, no. 4, (1998), 295–301

[5] H.J. Borchers, When Lorentz Invariance Imply wedge Duality?, *Lect. Math. Phys.* **35**, (1995), 39–60.

[6] H.J. Borchers, The CPT Theorem in two-dimensional theories of local observables, *Commun. Math. Phys.* **143** (1992), 315–332.

[7] D. Buchholz, O. Dreyer, M. Florig, S.J. Summers, Geometric modular action and spacetime symmetry groups, *Rev. Math. Phys.*, **12**, no. 4, (2000), 475–560.

[8] S. Doplicher, R. Longo, Standard and Split inclusions of von Neumann algebras, *Invent. Math.*, **75**, 3, 493–536, (1984).

[9] D. Guido, R. Longo, An algebraic spin and statistics theorem, *Commun. Math. Phys.* **172**, (1995), 517–533.

[10] R. Longo, "Lectures on Conformal Nets", preliminary lecture notes that are available at http://www.mat.uniroma2.it/∼longo/Lecture-Notes.html .

[11] R. Longo, Real Hilbert subspaces, modular theory, $\mathrm{SL}(2,\mathbb{R})$ and CFT, in: "Von Neumann algebras in Sibiu", pp. 33–91, *Theta Ser. Adv. Math.*, **10**, Theta, Bucharest (2008).

[12] R. Longo, V. Morinelli, K.-H.Rehren, Where Infinite Spin Particles Are Localizable, *Comm. in Math. Phys.* (2015).

[13] V. Morinelli, On the Bisognano-Wichmann Property, Nuclearity and Particle Localization, Ph.D. Thesis, Univ. of Rome "Tor Vergata" (2015).

[14] J. Mund, The Bisognano-Wichmann theorem for massive theories, *Ann. Henri Poincaré* **2** (2001), 907-926.

[15] B. Schroer, and H.-W. Wiesbrock, Modular theory and geometry, *Rev. Math. Phys.* 12, (2000), **1**, 139–158.